Abortion, the Human Fetal Cell Industry & Vaccines White Paper



Tanya Foster, M.A.

info@avoicefortruth.com

Contents

Purpose	02
Overview	03
WI-38: First Fetal Cell Line	04
RA 27/3: Second & Lesser Known Viral Fetal Cell Line	06
WI-38 & RA 27/3 Combined: Merck's Rubella Vaccine	06
Unethical Testing	07
MRC-5: Third Fetal Cell Line	08
There's More: Fetal Cell Lines After 1966	08
Walvax-2: Newest Fetal Cell Line	09
Human Fetal Cell Industry	09
Altering Abortion Methods for Tissue Harvesting	11
Lack of Informed Consent	12
The Missing Piece	13
Expanding Industry	14
The Deception	14
Intersection of Vaccines and Current Events	15
Why Does This Matter to Christians and Ministries	16
Reference List	19

Purpose

This project unexpectedly fell into my lap because of my child's health crisis, stumping doctors nearly a decade ago. Exploratory surgery was recommended, and questions arose: Was it food intake? Was it allergies or medication side effects? Was the body interacting badly with a medication or vaccine? I started on a journey to find answers where all these questions and more were explored.

At first, the vaccine question seemed easiest to answer. Surely, I thought, it was just water and a weakened version of the virus. So I turned to the most reputable source I knew to investigate the ingredients – the Centers for Disease Control website. That was when I first saw the words, "normal human diploid cells."

What? Why was the word "human" listed in multiple vaccines' ingredients? Attempting to answer this initial question snowballed into years of combing through scientific literature dating back to the 1930s. It revealed a 60-year link between vaccines and the abortion industry, clearly demonstrating the reliance many vaccines have on human fetal cell lines. These fetal cell lines are created from aborted babies and used in the production of vaccines. My reading not only revealed the use of abortions in vaccine research and development, but other disturbing details, such as the deception of expectant mothers, the mistreatment of aborted babies (sometimes born and dissected alive) and the trafficking of and profiting from aborted babies' organs, tissues and body parts.

This long history, plainly chronicled in scientific journals, directly contradicts the modern narrative that researchers used only two aborted children during vaccination development in the 1960s. Instead, they used hundreds – and *still counting*.

I have two purposes for writing this paper. The first was born out of the realization that many Christians and Christian ministries have unknowingly repeated this false narrative intentionally propagated by the abortion industry to cover up a sordid history. As a prolife Christian, I want to provide an accurate history for those who care about or have spoken about this issue. Like me, many may not realize how the promotion of vaccines using human fetal cell lines may undermine their overall efforts to stop the legalization of abortion and the legislation surrounding it.

My second purpose centers upon a recent legislative push to remove parental rights by eliminating religious exemptions for vaccines. Prior to learning the history of vaccines, I didn't understand why someone would want to exercise a religious exemption. It has become clear to me how pro-life Christians can hold legitimate biblical convictions against the use of aborted babies to create human fetal cell lines used in the production of today's vaccines. State and federal legislators need factual data – substantiated by science – to present an accurate history of the use of aborted babies in vaccine development.

I pray this information may open your eyes and motivate you to action as it has me.

We all deserve to know the truth.

Overview



For you created my inmost being; you knit me together in my mother's womb. I praise You because I am fearfully and wonderfully made.

- Psalm 139:13-14a (NIV)

99

To say there is a connection between vaccines and abortion would raise an eyebrow for many. To say some vaccines are cultured on human fetal cell lines from aborted babies and contain human DNA and protein might be outright shocking to most pro-life Christians. Scientific journals, however, have well documented the research, creation, use and progression of human fetal cell lines.

MRC-5 cells including DNA and protein, sucrose sorbitol, monosodium L-glutamate, sodium phosp sodium bicarbonate, potassium phosphate monobaphosphate dibasic, neomycin, bovine calf serum

VACCINE EXCIPIENT & MEDIA SUMMARY, CDC.COM

The extent to which the vaccine industry has utilized aborted babies over the past 60 years is a fact the industry does not seem to want the public to understand. For this reason, they have intentionally repeated a narrative year after year that is a drastically watered-down version of the scientific truth.

The following statements by Dr. Paul Offit of the Vaccine Education Center at Children's Hospital of Philadelphia and co-inventor of a rotavirus vaccine summarizes the narrative repeated by many:

One question that some parents are concerned about is whether or not vaccines are made using fetal cells. And the answer to that question is, yes.¹

Now, there were two elective abortions that were performed in the early 1960s. One was performed in England, the other was performed in Sweden. And those two elective abortions then created cells which have been used ever since.² [emphasis added]

Now, the answer to the question, is it true then that some of these vaccines that I've just mentioned could contain small quantities of residual DNA from those cells? And the answer to that question is, yes.³

These same embryonic cells obtained from the early 1960s have continued to grow in the laboratory and are used to make vaccines today. **No further sources of fetal cells are needed to make these vaccines**.⁴ [emphasis added]

These statements contain common misconceptions that stand in direct contradiction to the facts provided by the original researchers who developed human fetal cell lines WI-38, RA27/3 and MRC-5. The history that follows from the scientific literature provides a clearer and more accurate picture.

In addition to misconceptions surrounding the creation of the original cell lines in the 1960s, the literature shows a consistent, 60-year history of the biotechnology industry and its progression of developing fetal cell lines through the use of aborted babies. This is not an industry that used two babies who "would have been aborted anyway" years ago. Quite the contrary. Years ago, over a hundred babies were aborted in the quest to develop human fetal cell lines for the purpose of producing live virus vaccines.⁵ In fact, researchers used as many aborted babies as needed to obtain the desired outcomes.

Biotechnology companies did not stop there, but have shown their use of aborted babies to be a routine industry practice in the ongoing pursuit of creating new human fetal cell lines. The industry has been consistent from the early 1960s to as recently as 2015 with the newest Walvax-2 fetal cell line.⁶

The history presented in this paper will show:

- There are currently three main cell lines in use, not two.
- Over 100 abortions in the 1960s were used to develop these cell lines, not two.

- Human fetal cell line development has been ongoing since the original three were created.
- Human fetal cell line use has become the industry standard.⁷
- Hundreds of new vaccines are currently in development and need viable human fetal cell lines for production.
- The supply of aborted babies for research is ongoing and has now become an entire industry utilizing third party, middleman companies.⁸
- The treatment of the babies (who are sometimes alive after abortion) is gruesome and horrifying.
- The development of WI-38 began what is now a well-established industry projected to reach over \$50.42 billion by 2023,⁹ expanding beyond vaccines to other products¹⁰ and medications.¹¹

The following history is thoroughly documented through research published in reputable journals and other sources but is rarely discussed today. The chronological presentation begins with WI-38.

WI-38: First Fetal Cell Line

Human embryonic tissues were first used in vaccines between the 1930s and 1950s to cultivate the polio virus.^{12, 13, 14} However, it was

not until 1961 that Dr. Leonard Hayflick of the Wistar Institute in Philadelphia, Pennsylvania, began the first research and development around human fetal cell lines.

Prior to the development of human fetal cell lines, viral vaccines were typically cultured on animal tissue such as rhesus monkey cells. One of the unintended consequences discovered long after polio vaccine's use all over the world was its contamination by the cancer-causing SV-40 virus. This may have been one reason Hayflick turned to human fetal cell lines for use in culturing vaccines. Another reason was his deep concern for the possible extinction of the monkey species used¹⁵ – an attitude that reveals the lack of value he places on human life.

Hayflick's research required live tissue from aborted babies, but abortion was over a decade from becoming legal through *Roe v. Wade.* Instead of allowing that lack of legalization to impede his research, Hayflick called on his friend and colleague, Dr. Sven Gard of the Karolinska Institute in Sweden. The two began a collaboration that would extend through the eventual production of the WI-38 human fetal cell line. Hayflick's colleague, Dr. Stanley Plotkin, went on to also collaborate with Gard for his work developing a second human fetal cell line that will be discussed in the next section.

For two years, Hayflick worked to test and develop many human fetal cell lines for viability of use with vaccines. ¹⁶ The role of

Gard's laboratory was to secure live tissue from aborted babies, dissect them and send the tissues to the Wistar Institute. 17 In fact, all aborted babies were intentionally "chosen by Dr. Sven Gard, specifically for this purpose."18 Paving the way through research on a new frontier took much trial and error, but Hayflick was persistent. The first aborted baby produced his first cell line, WI-1 (Wistar Institute, 1st fetal sample). While he learned a great deal from this first fetal cell line, it was not viable for vaccine production. Pressing forward, he continued using aborted baby after aborted baby to develop cell lines through WI-38. At this point, the lung tissue of an aborted three to four-month gestation girl¹⁹ had finally given him the viable fetal cell line for which he was searching. For reasons unclear in the literature, Hayflick continued his research up through fetal cell line WI-44.

Two of Hayflick's early scientific publications provide thoroughly documented details of human fetal cell lines in his research, 20, 21 while details on his other cell lines are scarce. For example, at least 23 documented abortions – likely many more – were performed during the process of finding the viable WI-38 fetal cell line and the research that continued through WI-44. Fetal cell lines WI-1 to WI-27, WI-38, and WI-44 are described in detail and account for 23 abortions. Unfortunately, because there seem to be no journal articles detailing WI-28 to WI-37 and WI-39 to WI-43, a definitive number of abortions cannot be provided. Based on his published research for the other fetal cell lines, it is reasonable to assume that

up to 15 more abortions were used. It is clear, however, that well above 23 aborted babies (possibly as many as 38) were used in the development of the original human fetal cell line at the Wistar Institute.

WI-38 is still in use today, despite its aging, tumorigenic-prone (cancer-causing) cells. It is found in the MMR-II (MMR), ProQuad (MMRV), Varivax (Varicella) and Adenovirus vaccines.²²

RA 27/3: Second & Lesser Known Viral Fetal Cell Line

In 1964, the pharmaceutical company Merck & Co. began development of its rubella vaccine. The research team, led by Dr. Stanley Plotkin of the Wistar Institute and Children's Hospital of Philadelphia, **obtained 76 embryos** for multiple studies, including attempts to establish human fetal cell strains.²³

Forty embryos were used as the team worked to isolate the rubella virus in human fetal tissue. With abortion still illegal in the United States, Plotkin continued the collaboration between the Wistar Institute and Dr. Gard in Sweden, obtaining live tissue from surgically aborted babies. Spontaneous abortions in two Philadelphia hospitals were also used.

The timing was expedient as the 1964 rubella epidemic in the United States and Europe led

to an ample number of vulnerable pregnant mothers. ²⁴ The 27th aborted baby was "dissected immediately," and the rubella strain they obtained was used for Merck's vaccine. ²⁵ The viral strain is logically called RA 27/3 (Rubella, Abortus, 27th fetus, 3rd tissue culture explant). It is unclear why 13 more abortions were used after the rubella strain had been isolated.

Of the 40 abortions, 16 babies tested negative for rubella. ²⁶ Those rubella-free babies taken by surgical abortion were sacrificed for "science" and died unnecessarily. Adding insult to injury, other viable rubella strains had already been obtained without using abortion before Plotkin's research began. ²⁷

The rubella vaccine is commonly cited to have used at least 80 aborted babies in its development.²⁸

WI-38 & RA 27/3 Combined: Merck's Rubella Vaccine

After the rubella virus had been isolated, it needed to be cultivated on live cells to create the vaccine. Fetal cell line WI-38 was chosen and used to create the final vaccine product.²⁹ As a result, Merck's rubella vaccine contains two different fetal cell products – RA 27/3 and WI-38,³⁰ and is found in the MMR-II (MMR) and ProQuad (MMRV) vaccines.

This brief history only covers WI-38's development and the creation of one vaccine, rubella, using its fetal cell line, and unveils the death and use of over 100 aborted babies from Sweden. The commonly cited misconception that only two aborted babies were used for the development of human fetal cell lines to create vaccines is therefore proven grossly incorrect.

Unethical Testing

Upon development of the rubella vaccine, Plotkin **tested it on orphans as young as 14 months old,** "institutionalized **children**" and those with developmental disabilities noting, "thirteen seronegative **mentally retarded children were given RA 27/3 vaccine.**" 32, 33 Testing using vulnerable, young populations would be considered unethical to most.

Plotkin's choices are consistent with other professional choices he has made over the years. In other experiments, he used babies of mothers in prison, and performed experimental studies on over one million babies of mothers in the Belgian Congo under then-colonial rule.³⁴

Many documented examples exist to illustrate Plotkin's low value of human life. In a letter to the editor of the *New England Journal of Medicine* regarding ethics and human experimentation, ³⁵ Plotkin publicly defended a fellow researcher who had conducted 14 years of unethical experimental testing on already

sick and mistreated patients at Willowbrook, a state facility. The inhumane conditions and abuse of its patients were famously exposed by Geraldo Rivera in 1972,³⁶ leading to its eventual closing. Plotkin acknowledged authorship of his letter about the Willowbrook experimentation as recently as 2018 in a deposition.³⁷ His letter defending the use and abuse of patients at Willowbrook stated,

The question is whether we are to have experiments performed on fully functioning adults, and on children who are potential contributors to society, or are to perform initial studies in children and adults who are human in form but not in social potential.³⁸ [emphasis added]

He went on to say,

It may be objected that this question implies a Nazi philosophy, but I do not think that it is difficult **to distinguish nonfunctioning persons** from members of ethnic, racial, economic or other groups.³⁹ [emphasis added]

In addition to being a self-avowed atheist, Plotkin reveals in these statements his core beliefs about life, its value and origin. His worldview of moral relativism is seen most clearly when he said,

Mortality must be defined by circumstances and facts. To my mind, the Willowbrook studies are justified by

the facts concerning risk and by the benefits to society. 40 [emphasis added]

Plotkin is considered the leading authority on vaccines today, having helped develop more vaccines than anyone in the world. He regularly advises pharmaceutical companies and vaccine developers, and teaches vaccination courses around the world. He coauthored *Vaccines*, a textbook considered the foremost authority on the subject.

As the previous quotations evidence, he is open and vocal about his lack of respect for basic human dignity. After watching Geraldo Rivera's video documentary (see endnote 36), we must ask ourselves if an industry so heavily influenced, even to this day, by a man who defends experimental research on these most needy and defenseless children is worthy of our respect. Are his recommendations to the industry worthy of our unquestioning deference?

MRC-5: Third & Most Widely Used Fetal Cell Line

Following closely on the heels of Hayflick and Plotkin, the Medical Research Council in the United Kingdom, led by Dr. JP Jacobs, developed fetal cell line MRC-5 in 1966. A 14-week gestation baby boy was aborted for psychiatric reasons from a physically healthy

27-year-old mother. There were likely other abortions leading up to this one.⁴¹ The introduction of MRC-5 gave us the most recent of three main cell lines in use today.

MRC-5 has become the most widely used human fetal cell line. Its use continues today in vaccines like ProQuad (MMRV), Quadracel (DTaP-IPV), Pentacel (DTaP-IPV/Hib), Twinrix (Hep A/Hep B), Vaqta (Hep A), Havrix (Hep A), Imovax (Rabies), Varivax (Varicella), and Zostavax (Shingles).⁴²

There's More: Fetal Cell Lines After 1966

As stated in the overview, a common misconception exists that only two fetal cell lines with two corresponding abortions were used to create modern day vaccines. Since the initial fetal cell lines, researchers have continued fetal cell line development, some through the funding of the National Institutes of Health. A few of these fetal cell lines are HEK-293,43 MRC-7,44 MRC-9,45 IMR-90,46 IMR-91,47 TIG-1,48 PER.C6,49 HER 911,50 KMB-17,51 and Walvax-2.52 Many of these fetal cell lines can easily be purchased online.53,54,55,56,57,58,59 Every one of these represents an untold number of abortions.

This is not an exhaustive list, but it clearly demonstrates the pharmaceutical industry's consistent practice of using aborted babies for ongoing fetal cell research.

Walvax-2: Newest Fetal Cell Line

Chinese researchers worked for four years developing the Walvax-2 cell line **intending it** to "be used in manufacturing viral vaccines." A 2015 paper notes the diminishing supply of WI-38 and MRC-5, which are currently the most widely-used human fetal cell lines. Since WI-38 and MRC-5 are the industry standards, Walvax-2 researchers followed "the methods of Jacobs in 1970 and Hayflick in 1961." The new cell line was then tested against MRC-5, and found to be "equal or superior to MRC-5 for the propagation of viruses."

Nine babies were intentionally aborted to develop Walvax-2. It was eventually a threemonth gestation girl whose lung tissue was used for the final product.

Walvax-2 researchers used the "water bag" abortion method in order to ensure the babies were born alive and the tissues were "fresh." ⁶³ This method is illegal in the United States, but China has no law preventing its use. The water bag method entails filling the mother's uterus with saline water and floating the baby out of the mother's body, where he or she can then be **immediately dissected alive**.

The "source tissue material" section of the

Walvax-2 paper shows the intentionality of the abortions:

Before the study, we made strict and comprehensive inclusion criteria in order to guarantee a high quality cell strain: 1) gestational age 2 to 4 months; 2) induction of labor with the water bag method...

The tissues from the freshly aborted fetuses were immediately sent to the laboratory for the preparation of the cells.⁶⁴ [emphasis added]

The Walvax-2 paper also clearly outlines the decades-long history of the human fetal cell industry, in addition to showing how **the cell strain poises the industry for future growth**. Consider the paper's title, which itself proves that fetal cell lines are still being produced intentionally in the present day. It reads, "Characteristics and viral propagation properties of a new human diploid cell line, Walvax-2, and its suitability as a candidate cell substrate for vaccine production."

Human Fetal Cell Industry

The human fetal cell industry functioned for decades without the public's awareness of its activities and inner-workings. Slowly, parts of this industry have been exposed. This paper aims to pull back the curtain fully. The three intertwined industries critical to the human fetal cell industry are:

- Research and, indirectly, vaccine consumers – providing the demand
- 2. Planned Parenthood **providing the** aborted babies
- 3. Third-party fetal tissue procurement companies acting as middlemen between the two making the transaction "legal" in the United States

Research. The role of research has been to provide continuous demand for aborted babies' organs, tissues and body parts. As history has shown, the demand – specifically from the vaccine industry – existed before *Roe v. Wade*, and became a built-in stream of profit for the abortion industry when it was legalized. In a 2017 letter to Congress, an organization representing researchers stated:

Fetal tissue remains a critical resource to further researchers' understanding of how human tissues develop and are affected by disease. Critical scientific advances – such as **the development of vaccines** against polio, rubella, measles, chickenpox, adenovirus, and rabies... **depend on research using fetal tissue**.⁶⁵ [emphasis added]

Planned Parenthood. Planned Parenthood's role is clear. Its practice of selling fetal body parts has been exposed through several investigations, the most recent of which was the undercover work of the Center for

Medical Progress and testimony at the resulting Congressional hearing. Pro-life Christians are largely aware of these atrocities. What many are unaware of, however, is that the demand for the sale of fetal body parts began from the vaccine industry. For example, abortion was legalized in 1973, and in 1975, the **United States government** through the National Institutes on Aging **funded the research of the IMR-90 fetal cell line** and went on to fund the research of the IMR-91 fetal cell line as well.

Tissue Procurement Companies. The

Congressional hearings also brought to light the existence of middleman, third party companies critical to the industry after a 1974 law made it illegal to profit from the sale of fetuses or their organs, tissues, or body parts. The tissue procurement companies protect organizations like Planned Parenthood and researchers by doing the work that would be illegal for them to do themselves. Their role is to obtain regular updates from Planned Parenthood on mothers and babies scheduled for abortion. Then they determine which babies are the best fit, match a baby to current requests from researchers, are present in the facility to conduct the dissection of the baby after abortion and mail the baby's organs and/ or tissues to the requesting recipient.

Understanding the full impact of this industry on women and babies is vital. What the human fetal cell industry has engaged in for more than half a century is exacerbated by two more egregious acts: altering abortion methods for tissue harvesting and an intentionally manipulated (or, in some cases, nonexistent) informed consent process for mothers.

Altering Abortion Methods for Tissue Harvesting

66

[T]here is evidence that companies may be violating the law, by openly trafficking fetal body parts, influencing consent to donate and modifying abortion procedures.⁶⁶

99

Multiple sources and investigations have found the modification of abortion procedures to be normal practice for abortions intended for organ and tissue harvesting.⁶⁷ Walvax-2 is a good example of abortion modification, as the water bag method ensures live birth abortions, providing fresh fetuses for research.

The manner in which babies' organs and tissues are obtained is important to understand. According to Dr. C. Ward Kischer, a leading authority on human embryology, in order for the tissue to be viable for use in vaccines and research, it must be taken within minutes after abortion – at most five minutes.⁶⁸

Those critical minutes after abortion are the reason tissue procurement companies in the United States are **intentional about choosing babies ahead of time** and are

present in the facility for the abortion in order to immediately dissect the baby and freeze his/ her organs and tissues for shipping.

After investigating and conducting interviews, a 2016 House of Representatives report noted:

The middleman company often embeds a tissue technician in a clinic on the days that abortions are performed. The procurement company pays the clinic on a per tissue basis. The number of saleable body parts in many ways depends upon the methodology of the doctor performing the abortion.⁶⁹

The murder and live dissection of some babies without even the help of pain reliever was documented as far back as the 1960s in Sweden, in the babies used for WI-38 and RA 27/3 research and development.⁷⁰ It is evidenced again in a more recent story about a set of twins recounted by a former employee of a U.S. middleman company, who,

... told of seeing babies wounded but alive after abortion procedures, and in one case a set of twins "still moving on the table" when clinicians from AGF [Anatomic Gift Foundation] began dissecting the children to harvest their organs. The children, he said, were 'cuddling each other' and 'gasping for breath' when medics moved in for the kill.⁷¹

In September 2019, two individuals from the Center for Medical Progress found themselves in court, defending their undercover video work against a host of charges. At the center of testimony during a portion of the hearing in California was a Stanford study that used **live fetal heart tissue** from a tissue procurement company working with Planned Parenthood. During the testimony,

The CEO of StemExpress [tissue procurement company] essentially admitted in court Thursday that her biotech company supplies beating fetal hearts and intact fetal heads to medical researchers.⁷²

The 2012 Stanford study stated in its "methods" section:

In brief, **human fetal hearts** (StemExpress, Diamond Springs, CA) were perfused using a Langendorff apparatus, using Tyrode solution containing collagenase and protease.⁷³

Stem cell expert Dr. Theresa Deisher explained when and how the Langendorff apparatus is used. A journalist in the courtroom summarized Deisher's testimony stating:

... in order to be used in research and on a Langendorff apparatus, a human fetal heart "has to be beating" when harvested from the baby. The heart must then "be arrested in a relaxed position" by perfusing it with a potassium

solution to be transported to the research site, where it is started again electrically.⁷⁴

According to the Liberty Counsel,

Dr. Deisher said the nature of those studies indicated that the hearts had to be still beating when cut out, without anesthesia, from the aborted babies.⁷⁵

Similarly, a 1952 polio vaccine study described beating hearts in the "specimens" they used:

Human embryos of **two and one-half to five months gestation** were obtained... in many of the embryos **the heart was still beating** at the time of receipt in the virus laboratory.⁷⁶

This 1952 study together with current testimony in California show the longitudinal intentionality of abortion modification in the industry.

Lack of Informed Consent

Another sad reality is the lack of or intentionally manipulated informed consent of mothers donating their aborted babies for research. This has been evidenced consistently over the years. Referring to early fetal cell line research, Dr. Erling Norrby remarked,

... at the time in the early 1960s when organs from aborted fetuses were collected and sent to the Wistar Institute no one had as yet invented the concept of informed consent.⁷⁷

A few decades later, long after informed consent had become standard practice, interviews with tissue procurement company employees for a 20/20 investigation revealed,

... by using legal "mumbo jumbo" it is easy to get women to "consent" to having their aborted babies used in medical experimentation.⁷⁸

In 2015, Abby Johnson, a former Planned Parenthood director with firsthand knowledge of abortion clinics and procedures, validates the practices of harvesting of fetal tissue and manipulating informed consent, stating:

During the season of tissue harvesting, an intact body was gold. An intact fetal body is considered perfection in the land of fetal tissue research. But dismembered body parts were okay, too... and that is usually what we gave them. I would check the patient's chart to make sure that they had signed the consent for us to donate their baby's remains. Almost every woman did, because we made it seem like that by donating, they were helping others... altruism during abortion.⁷⁹

Most recently, the House of Representatives hearing found Planned Parenthood to have "a consent process that fails to meet federal requirements,"80 stating,

Planned Parenthood's consent form was insufficient for obtaining informed consent...

and

... executives admitted that the form was legally insufficient.⁸¹

The Missing Piece

It is critical to have full knowledge of that which we are consenting to by using vaccines containing fetal cell lines. To do that, we must acknowledge all pieces of the puzzle. Pro-life Christians have acknowledged the evil being perpetrated by Planned Parenthood. We have begun to acknowledge the actions of third-party companies. Some have a vague awareness that research provides the demand, and it is this third part of the industry that we must see clearly.

Remember, demand for aborted babies for research was well established before

Roe v. Wade. The human fetal cell industry has been providing the demand for aborted babies ever since abortion was made legal in the United States. We have been viewing an incomplete puzzle for years, and this is the piece we have been missing. As Christians, we have been addressing one or two parts of the industry, hoping for change. This third piece

must be addressed in order to create real, lasting change in the legality of abortion, the practices of Planned Parenthood and the trafficking of fetal body parts.

Expanding Industry

Before 1960, animal cells were primarily used for culturing vaccines, and the industry consisted of just three injections – DTP, polio, and small pox. Beginning with Hayflick's research in 1961 and the introduction of human fetal cell lines, the vaccine industry grew into a \$36.45 billion global industry by 2018 and is expected to reach \$50.42 billion by 2023.82 Vaccines are a huge, profitable industry for pharmaceutical companies. The human fetal cell industry is a direct outgrowth of the vaccines they support.

What began with skirting the law by obtaining aborted babies from Sweden has grown into a large industry in the United States and has expanded to exporting our legally aborted and dissected babies to other countries for research.⁸³

The demand for new fetal cell lines for use in vaccines is increasing rapidly. The demand is four-fold:

- Fetal cell lines are now the standard in the industry.⁸⁴
- 2. As previously mentioned, the existing cell lines are tumorigenic and need replacement.
- 3. Over 260 new vaccines are currently in development, many of which

require viable fetal cell lines for production.⁸⁵

4. Not only does the childhood vaccine schedule⁸⁶ continue to expand and increase demand, but the creation of an adult vaccine schedule⁸⁷ is increasing demand as well.

The pharmaceutical vaccine industry using fetal cell lines is only gaining momentum.

In addition to all the fetal cell lines created and intended for vaccine use, the industry has expanded to develop and use fetal cell lines for other purposes, including other research, pharmaceutical medication,⁸⁸ cosmetics,⁸⁹ and research for food flavor enhancers.⁹⁰

The Deception

"It was just two babies."

"It was a long time ago."

"WI-38 and MRC-5 were one-time events."

"No more abortions are necessary."

"Killing a preborn child is an ethically distinct act from that of producing a vaccine after the abortion has already been performed."

"Vaccines provide so much good; God must be redeeming what Satan meant for evil."

"If we ask vaccine manufacturers to quit, that's enough."

This paper exposes the egregious human rights violations of the industry that has taken the lives of hundreds of babies, has often misled their mothers into consenting to donate their aborted babies for experimentation and has then intentionally tested their product on the most vulnerable populations among us.

It is often stated that ongoing abortions are not necessary to maintain the cell lines currently in use (refer to the quote by Dr. Paul Offit on page 2). While technically true, this language by the vaccine industry is **intentionally misleading**.

Yes, there are no new abortions necessary to maintain WI-38 or MRC-5. However, the aging cell lines are finite. Their use is coming to an end and necessarily requires the production of new cell lines, using more aborted babies. Hence, the actions of the industry itself prove that ongoing abortions are necessary. After the development of WI-38 and MRC-5, to the present day, many human fetal cell lines have been created, each using numerous aborted babies.

Abortions and vaccine production are not separate events, but are in fact tied together by necessity. Data shows the intentionality of manipulated informed consent, altered abortion methods and immediate dissection of aborted babies in order to deliver live body parts, organs and tissues to researchers. These events cannot be seen apart from each other, and the

ethical consequences of each cannot be analyzed in a vacuum.

In 2015, Walvax-2 murdered nine babies to create the most recent human fetal cell line for use in vaccination. That same year, some Christian ministries called on vaccine manufacturers to develop vaccines that do not rely on fetal tissue from aborted babies.

In light of its 60-year use of aborted babies for the development of human fetal cell lines, simply calling on vaccine manufacturers to stop is woefully inadequate. Their ongoing actions and current trajectory make it clear they have no intention of stopping.

Without realizing it, we who have faithfully trusted the recommended vaccination schedule for our children for the better part of six decades have become unwittingly complicit in the abortive human fetal cell industry.

Intersection of Vaccines and Current Events

How does the history of human fetal cell lines relate to current events? The horrors of the inner workings of Planned Parenthood and the sale of baby body parts, organs and tissues has been exposed time and again. More recently, we have seen states move to **expand abortion laws**. Christians in particular

watched in disbelief as New York passed a law allowing for abortion up until birth.⁹¹ Virginia proposed abortion up until the day of birth,⁹² with its governor clarifying that a mother could decide to abort her baby just after birth. Then, the federal Born-Alive Abortion Survivors Protection Act⁹³ failed, thereby failing to require life-saving measures when a botched abortion causes a baby to be born alive.

Pro-life supporters could not conceive why anyone would allow for abortion up until birth or block a law that would simply mandate babies be saved after surviving abortion. Christians scratched their heads, trying to make sense of the horror. For good reason – it does not make sense on the surface. Focus on the Family was so deeply disturbed by how far the government had gone that it showed the world its support for life during its Alive from New York campaign. ⁹⁴

How does all this relate to fetal cell lines and vaccines? Just below the surface is the obvious rationale that seems to tie it all together. The requirement that fetal tissue be alive and obtained within five minutes of abortion is the logical driver of the expanded legislation. It is also the driver of the failure of the federal legislation. The human fetal cell industry would suffer tremendously if doctors were required to save all aborted babies born alive.

Why Does This Matter To Christians and Christian Ministries?



We believe that human beings are created by God in His image.

Therefore every person, from conception to natural death, possesses inherent dignity and immeasurable worth – including preborn children, elderly individuals, those with special needs and others marginalized by society. Christians, then, are called to defend, protect, and value all human life. 95

99

This statement summarizes what many Christians believe the Bible teaches about the inherent value and sanctity of all human life, and God's call for us to **defend and protect all those precious lives**. Many individual Christians and Christian ministries fight hard against the abortion industry. Many have addressed Planned Parenthood and its fetal organ and tissue harvesting. Christians have fought to expose and end threats to the sanctity of life. We were not silent during sad and disturbing recent events. Many pray for an end to abortion and work tirelessly with mothers and their children at crisis pregnancy centers and other ministries. Praise God for

what so many faithful followers of Jesus have done to defend life and will no doubt continue to do in the future.

However, these actions will not result in what we hope until we address the entire industry. Planned Parenthood will not stop until its revenue source ceases to exist. To address the sanctity of life in full is to also address the vaccine industry's demand for fetal body parts. Accurately addressing vaccines developed and cultivated with fetal cell lines is vital to the fight for the sanctity of life. Anything less hinders our work in this arena. Consistency in our pro-life message is critical and can no longer be ignored.

In the area of vaccines, some Christians and ministries have unknowingly taken positions in contradiction to their own core value of the sanctity of human life, and have based those positions on intentionally deceptive and incorrect information promoted by the industry itself. In contrast, the history presented here shows an industry, no matter how much perceived good it provides, that is built on a foundation of consistently violating the God-given value and dignity of preborn children for over half a century. The human fetal cell industry is large, rapidly expanding and growing more dependent on human fetal cell lines and aborted fetal tissue than ever before.

In order to provide accurate information to other Christians and ministry partners, we must consider the impact the following summary will have on our position regarding vaccines:

- The original intent of the development of fetal cell lines was for their use in producing vaccines.
- 2. Over 100 aborted babies were used during the research and development of WI-38, RA 27/3 and MRC-5, while the current narrative acknowledges only two abortions.
- 3. Cell lines are finite, become more tumorigenic over time and require replacement.
- 4. New fetal cell lines, and the abortions supporting them, have been and continue to be in development since the mid-1960s.
- 5. Hundreds of new vaccines many requiring the use of fetal cell substrates are currently in development.
- 6. Babies are intentionally aborted sometimes surviving abortion and are often dissected alive with no pain relief.
- Mothers are often misled to provide consent for research, unaware of how abortion procedures are then modified and how their babies are being used.
- 8. Abortions and research are inextricably tied together they are **not two separate events**.
- 9. This has been and continues to be an industry that only has a market because of our approval, support and strong

- recommendation of the vaccines created using fetal cell lines.
- The vaccine and human fetal cell industries are brutal and unethical, and show little to no regard for human dignity.

On the one hand, we Christians champion the dignity and sanctity of all life; yet, on the other hand, we are supportive of an industry with a persistent track record of profiting from the murder of our youngest and most vulnerable. Yes, all of us want to protect our children from unnecessary pain and disease. However, it seems our good intentions have blinded our ability to see the harsh reality of the human fetal cell industry. In protecting our own children, we have failed to protect others.

Believers' unintentional complicity in fetal cell line use for vaccine development has given rise to a strong, thriving industry that shows no sign of slowing down. The data and scientific literature give us every reason to assume this long-established practice will continue. There is no basis to assume fetal cell line development will stop. In fact, with the large increase in the number of vaccines in development and the ever-expanding child and adult vaccination schedules, the market for aborted babies is only strengthening.

Consistent with the stand so many Christians have taken to defend the sanctity of life, we should also stand for these children who have no voice. Christians and Christian ministries should lead by example, particularly because of the strong positions we already take regarding the sanctity of every human life. The world is looking for integrity. Many are looking for accurate information. They rely on our commitment to the Lord, truth, and reliable content to help them make life-impacting decisions on behalf of their families.

Please give this difficult issue deep, prayerful consideration as you seek the direction the Lord will take you and your ministry.

Before I formed you in the womb I knew you, and before you were born I consecrated you.

-Jeremiah 1:5 (ESV)

Reference List

¹ Are fetal cells used to make vaccines? (Dr. Paul Offit, video and transcript) [Children's Hospital of Philadelphia website]. 2015. Available at: https://www.chop.edu/centers-programs/vaccine-education-center/video/are-fetal-cells-used-make-vaccines. Accessed on September 14, 2019.

² Ibid.

³ Ibid.

- ⁴ Vaccine Ingredients Fetal Tissues. [Children's Hospital of Philadelphia website]. 2017. Available at: https://www.chop.edu/centers-programs/vaccine-education-center/vaccine-ingredients/fetal-tissues. Accessed on September 14, 2019.
- ⁵ Hayflick L, Moorhead PS. The serial cultivation of human diploid cell strains. *Experimental Cell Research*. 1961;25:585-621. PMID: 13905658.
- ⁶ Ma B, He LF, Zhang YL, et al. Characteristics and viral propagation properties of a new human diploid cell line, Walvax-2, and its suitability as a candidate cell substrate for vaccine production. *Human Vaccines & Immunotherapeutics*. 2015;11(4):998-1009. PMID <u>25803132</u>.
- ⁷ Scientists say fetal tissue remains essential for vaccines and developing treatments. [PBS website]. Aug 11, 2015. Available at: https://www.pbs.org/newshour/health/medical-researchers-say-fetal-tissue-remains-essential. Accessed June 12, 2019.
- ⁸ U.S. House of Representatives Final Report, Select Investigative Panel of the Energy and Commerce Committee. Pg. 352. [House.gov website]. December 30, 2016. Available at: https://archives-energycommerce.house.gov/sites/republicans.energycommerce.house.gov/files/documents/Select_Investigative_Panel_Final_Report.pdf. Accessed on July 24, 2019.
- ⁹ Vaccines Market by Disease (Pneumococcal, Influenza, DTP, HPV, Hepatitis, Meningococcal, Rotavirus, Polio, MMR, Varicella, Dengue), Technology (Live, Toxoid, Recombinant), Route (IM/SC, Oral), Patient (Pediatric, Adult), Type Global Forecast to 2023. [Markets and Markets website]. 2018. Available at: https://www.marketsandmarkets.com/Market-Reports/vaccine-technologies-market-1155.html. Accessed June 12, 2019.
- ¹⁰ Aborted fetus cells used in beauty creams. [Washington Times website]. November 3, 2009. Available at: https://m.washingtontimes.com/news/2009/nov/3/aborted-fetus-cells-used-in-anti-aging-products/. Accessed July 21, 2019.
- ¹¹ U.S. Aborted Fetal Products. [Children of God for Life website]. December 2018. Available at: https://cogforlife.org/wp-content/uploads/fetalproductsall.pdf. Accessed on July 21, 2019.
- ¹² Albert B Sabin AB, Olitsky PK. Cultivation of poliomyelitis virus in vitro in human embryonic tissue. *Proceedings of the Society for Experimental Biology and Medicine*. 1936;34:357-359.
- ¹³ Enders JF, Weller TH, Robbins FC. Cultivation of the Lansing strain of poliomyelitis virus in cultures of various human embryonic tissues. *Science*. 1949;109(2822):85-7. PMID: <u>17794160</u>.
- ¹⁴ Thicke JC, Duncan D, Wood W, Franklin AE, Rhodes AJ. Cultivation of poliomyelitis virus in tissue culture. I. Growth of the Lansing strain in human embryonic tissues. *Canadian Journal of Medical Science*. 1952;30(3):231-45. PMID: 14945014.
- ¹⁵ Leiva R. A brief history of human diploid cell strains. National Catholic Bioethics Quarterly. 2006;6(3):443-51.
- ¹⁶ Hayflick L, Moorhead PS. The serial cultivation of human diploid cell strains. *Experimental Cell Research*. 1961;25:585-621. PMID: <u>13905658</u>.

- ¹⁷ Norrby E. Listen to the Music: The Life of Hilary Koprowski (review). *Perspectives in Biology and Medicine*. 2001;44(2): 304-306. doi:10.1353/pbm.2001.0033.
- ¹⁸ Sven G, Plotkin S and McCarthy K. Gamma globulin prophylaxis; inactivated rubella virus; production and biologics control of live attenuated rubella virus vaccines. *American Journal of Diseases of Children*. 1969;118(2):372-381. PMID: 4183353.
- ¹⁹ Hayflick L. The limited in vitro lifetime of human diploid cell strains. *Experimental Cell Research*. 1965;37:615,625. PMID: 14315085.
- ²⁰ Hayflick L, Moorhead PS. The serial cultivation of human diploid cell strains. *Experimental Cell Research*. 1961;25:585-621. PMID: <u>13905658</u>.
- ²¹ Hayflick L. The limited in vitro lifetime of human diploid cell strains. *Experimental Cell Research*. 1965;37:614-36. PMID: 14315085.
- ²² Vaccine Excipient Summary: Excipients Included in U.S. Vaccines, by Vaccine. [CDC website]. 2019. Available at: https://www.cdc.gov/vaccines/pubs/pinkbook/downloads/appendices/b/excipient-table-2.pdf. Accessed June 12, 2019.
- *Please Note: In late June 2019, the CDC website removed human fetal cell line WI-38 from its Vaccine Excipient Summary. However, **WI-38 has not been removed from vaccines**, and the ingredients on the vaccine package inserts have remained the same. The Vaccine Excipient Summary accessed on June 12, 2019, and used for this paper accurately reflects the pharmaceutical companies package inserts.
- ²³ Boué A, Hannoun C, Boué JG, Plotkin SA. Cytological virological and chromosomal studies of cell strains from aborted human fetuses. *Proceedings of the Society for Experimental Biology and Medicine*. 1966;122(1):11-6. PMID: <u>5949788</u>.
- ²⁴ Plotkin SA, Farquhar JD, Katz M, Buser F. Attenuation of RA27/3 rubella virus in WI-38 human diploid cells. *American Journal of Diseases of Children*. 1969;118(2):178-185. PMID: <u>5794813</u>.
- ²⁵ Plotkin SA, Cornfeld D, Ingalls TH. Studies of immunization with living rubella virus. Trials in children with a strain cultured from an aborted fetus. *American Journal of Diseases of Children*. 1965;110(4):381-9. PMID <u>5834207</u>.
- ²⁶ Chang TH, Moorhead PS, Boué JG, Plotkin SA, Hoskins JM. Chromosome studies of human cells infected in utero and in vitro with rubella virus. *Proceedings of the Society for Experimental Biology and Medicine*. 1966;122(1):236-243. PMID: 5949790.
- ²⁷ Perkins FT. Licensed vaccines. Reviews of Infectious Diseases. 1985;7 Suppl 1:S73-6. PMID: 4001738.
- ²⁸ Leiva R. A brief history of human diploid cell strains. National Catholic Bioethics Quarterly. 2006;6(3):443-51.
- ²⁹ Plotkin SA, Farquhar JD, Katz M, Buser F. Attenuation of RA27/3 rubella virus in WI-38 human diploid cells. *American Journal of Diseases of Children*. 1969;118(2):178-185. PMID: <u>5794813</u>.
- ³⁰ M-M-R® II (MEASLES, MUMPS, and RUBELLA VIRUS VACCINE LIVE). [Merck website]. May, 2017. Available at: https://www.merck.com/product/usa/pi_circulars/m/mmr_ii/mmr_ii_pi.pdf. Accessed on July 20, 2019.
- ³¹ Plotkin SA, Cornfeld D, Ingalls TH. Studies of immunization with living rubella virus. Trials in children with a strain cultured from an aborted fetus. *American Journal of Diseases of Children*. 1965;110(4):381-9. PMID <u>5834207</u>.
- ³² Plotkin SA, Farquhar JD, Katz M, Buser F. Attenuation of RA27/3 rubella virus in WI-38 human diploid cells. *American Journal of Diseases of Children*. 1969;118(2):178-185. PMID: <u>5794813</u>.
- ³³ Fetal Tissue in Vaccines, Studies on Orphans Confirmed By Stanley Plotkin Under Oath. [YouTube website]. January 11, 2018. Available at: https://youtu.be/N16LWcGGm7I. Found at 17:32:58-17:35:18. Accessed on October 1, 2019.
- ³⁴ Fetal Tissue in Vaccines, Studies on Orphans Confirmed By Stanley Plotkin Under Oath. [YouTube website]. January 11, 2018. Available at: https://youtu.be/N16LWcGGm7I. Found at 17:37:39-17:38:06. Accessed on October 1, 2019.

- 35 Plotkin SA. Ethics of human experimentation. New England Journal of Medicine. 1973;289(11):593-4. PMID: 4723118.
- ³⁶ Last Great Disgrace 1972. [Geraldo website]. 1972. Available at: http://geraldo.com/page/willowbrook. Accessed July 14, 2019.
- ³⁷ Stanley Plotkin, Under Oath on Vaccines Full 9h Video. [YouTube website]. January 11, 2018. Available at: https://youtu.be/ZS0cYAFs2ps. Accessed on October 1, 2019.
- ³⁸ Fetal Tissue in Vaccines, Studies on Orphans Confirmed By Stanley Plotkin Under Oath. [YouTube website]. January 11, 2018. Available at: https://youtu.be/N16LWcGGm7I. Found at 17:36:40-17:37:38. Accessed on October 1, 2019.
- 39 Ibid.
- ⁴⁰ Plotkin SA. Ethics of human experimentation. New England Journal of Medicine. 1973;289(11):593-4. PMID: 4723118.
- 41 Jacobs JP, Jones CM, Baille JP. Characteristics of a human diploid cell designated MRC-5. *Nature*. 1970;227(5254): 168-70. PMID $\underline{4316953}$.
- ⁴² Vaccine Excipient Summary: Excipients Included in U.S. Vaccines, by Vaccine. [CDC website]. 2019. Available at: https://www.cdc.gov/vaccines/pubs/pinkbook/downloads/appendices/b/excipient-table-2.pdf. Accessed June 12, 2019.
- *Please Note: In late June 2019, the CDC website removed human fetal cell line WI-38 from its Vaccine Excipient Summary. However, WI-38 has not been removed from vaccines, and the ingredients on the vaccine package inserts have remained the same. The Vaccine Excipient Summary accessed on June 12, 2019, and used for this paper accurately reflects the pharmaceutical companies package inserts.
- ⁴³ Lin YC, Boone M, Meuris L, et al. Genome dynamics of the human embryonic kidney 293 lineage in response to cell biology manipulations. Nature Communications. 2014;5:4767. PMID: <u>25182477</u>.
- ⁴⁴ MRC-7. [Sigma-Aldrich website]. 2019. Available at: https://www.sigmaaldrich.com/catalog/product/sigma/cb-85020203?lang=en®ion=US. Accessed on July 21, 2019.
- ⁴⁵ Jacobs JP, Garrett AJ, Merton R. Characteristics of a serially propagated human diploid cell designated MRC-9. Journal of Biological Standardization. 1979;7(2):113-22. PMID: <u>113411</u>.
- ⁴⁶ Nichols WW, Murphy DG, Cristofalo VJ, Toji LH, Greene AE, Dwight SA. Characterization of a new human diploid cell strain, IMR-90. *Science*. 1977;196(4285):60-3. PMID: <u>841339</u>.
- ⁴⁷ Nichols WW, Cristofalo VJ, Toji LH, et al. Characterization of a new human diploid cell line--IMR-91. *In Vitro*. 1983;19(10):797-804. PMID: <u>6629383</u>.
- ⁴⁸ Ohashi M, Aizawa S, Ooka H, et al. A new human diploid cell strain, TIG-1, for the research on cellular aging. *Experimental Gerontology* . 1980;15(2):121-33. PMID: 7389832.
- ⁴⁹ Pau MG, Ophorst C, Koldijk MH, Schouten G, Mehtali M, Uytdehaag F. The human cell line PER.C6 provides a new manufacturing system for the production of influenza vaccines. *Vaccine*. 2001;19(17-19):2716-21. PMID 11257414.
- ⁵⁰ Fallaux FJ, Kranenburg O, Cramer SJ, Houweling A, Van Ormondt H, Hoeben RC, Van Der Eb AJ. Characterization of 911: a new helper cell line for the titration and propagation of early region 1-deleted adenoviral vectors. *Human Gene Therapy*. 1996;7(2):215-22. PMID: <u>8788172</u>.
- ⁵¹ Guo R, Cao YY, Dai ZZ, Qu SR, Zhuang JY. [Characteristics of a human diploid cell line, KMB-17]. Zhongguo Yi Xue Ke Xue Yuan Xue Bao. 1981;3(4):226-30. PMID: 6459859.
- ⁵² Ma B, He LF, Zhang YL, et al. Characteristics and viral propagation properties of a new human diploid cell line, Walvax-2, and its suitability as a candidate cell substrate for vaccine production. *Human Vaccines & Immunotherapeutics*. 2015;11(4):998-1009. PMID <u>25803132</u>.

- ⁵³ HEK-293. [ATCC website]. 2019. Available at: https://www.atcc.org/products/all/CRL-1573.aspx. Accessed on July 21, 2019.
- ⁵⁴ MRC-7. [Sigma-Aldrich website]. 2019. Available at: https://www.sigmaaldrich.com/catalog/product/sigma/cb-85020203?lang=en®ion=US. Accessed on July 21, 2019.
- ⁵⁵ MRC-9. [ATCC website]. 2019. Available at: https://www.atcc.org/products/all/CCL-212.aspx. Accessed on July 21, 2019.
- ⁵⁶ IMR-90. [ATCC website]. 2019. Available at: https://www.atcc.org/products/all/CCL-186.aspx. Accessed on July 21, 2019.
- ⁵⁷ IMR-91. [Coriell Institute website]. 2019. Available at: https://www.coriell.org/0/Sections/Search/Sample_Detail.aspx?Ref=I91L-12&Product=CC. Accessed on July 21, 2019.
- ⁵⁸ TIG-1. [Coriell Institute website]. 2019. Available at: https://www.coriell.org/0/Sections/Search/Sample-Detail.aspx?Ref=AG06173&PgId=166. Accessed on July 21, 2019.
- ⁵⁹ PER.C6. [Creative Biolabs website]. 2019. Available at: http://www.gmp-creativebiolabs.com/per-c6-cell-lines 74.htm. Accessed on July 21, 2019.
- ⁶⁰ Ma B, He LF, Zhang YL, et al. Characteristics and viral propagation properties of a new human diploid cell line, Walvax-2, and its suitability as a candidate cell substrate for vaccine production. *Human Vaccines & Immunotherapeutics*. 2015;11(4):998-1009. PMID <u>25803132</u>.
- 61 Ibid.
- 62 Ibid.
- 63 Ibid.
- 64 Ibid.
- 65 Federation of American Societies for Experimental Biology letter. [FASEB website]. September 5, 2017. Available at: http://www.faseb.org/Portals/2/PDFs/opa/2017/Fetal-Tissue-Stem-Cell-Letter.pdf? http://www.faseb.org/Portals/2/PDFs/opa/2017/Fetal-Tissue-Stem-Cell-Letter.pdf? http://www.faseb.org/portals/2/PDFs/opa/2017/Fetal-Tissue-Stem-Cell-Letter.pdf? http://www.faseb.org/portals/2/PDFs/opa/2017/Fetal-Tissue-Stem-Cell-Letter.pdf http://www.faseb.org/portals/2/PDFs/opa/2017/Fetal-Tissue-Stem-Cell-Letter.pdf http://www.faseb.org/portals/2/PDFs/opa/2017/Fetal-Tissue-Stem-Cell-Letter.pdf http://www.faseb.org/portals/2/PDFs/opa/2017/Fe
- ⁶⁶ 20/20 Exposes Trafficking In Fetal Body Parts. [The Free Library website]. March 1, 2000. Available at: https://www.thefreelibrary.com/20%2f20+Exposes+Trafficking+In+Fetal+Body+Parts.-a060474305. Accessed on July 20, 2019.
- ⁶⁷ U.S. House of Representatives Final Report, Select Investigative Panel of the Energy and Commerce Committee. Pg. 352-360. [House.gov website]. December 30, 2016. Available at: https://archives-energycommerce.house.gov/sites/republicans.energycommerce.house.gov/files/documents/Select_Investigative_Panel_Final_Report.pdf. Accessed on July 24, 2019.
- ⁶⁸ Another Felony at Planned Parenthood Caught on Camera. [Children of God for Life website]. July 20, 2015. Available at: https://cogforlife.org/2015/07/20/another-felony-at-planned-parenthood-caught-on-camera/. Accessed on September 15, 2019.
- ⁶⁹ U.S. House of Representatives Final Report, Select Investigative Panel of the Energy and Commerce Committee. Pg. 352. [House.gov website]. December 30, 2016. Available at: https://archives-energycommerce.house.gov/sites/republicans.energycommerce.house.gov/files/documents/Select_Investigative_Panel_Final_Report.pdf. Accessed on July 24, 2019.

- ⁷⁰ Nathanson B. Harvesting the Fetus. Lecture presented at: Human Life International, Conference on Love, Life and the Family; April 6-10, 1994; Irvine, California.
- "Now at 21 weeks, what they were doing, or 18 weeks, or 16 weeks, was what are called prostaglandin abortions. They would inject a substance into the womb. The woman would then go into mini-labor and pass this baby. Fifty percent of the time, the baby would be born alive, but that didn't stop them. They would just simply open up the abdomen of the baby with no anesthesia, and take out the liver and kidneys."

Former abortion doctor, Bernard Nathanson, is referring to the abortion clinic in Sweden that both Dr. Hayflick and Dr. Plotkin used to obtain aborted babies for their research.

- ⁷¹ Fetal body parts used for research. November 2006. Investigate Magazine. [InvestigateDaily website]. Reprinted on March 7, 2012. Available at: https://investigatemagazine.co.nz/2451/fetal-body-parts-used-for-reseach/. Accessed June 14, 2019.
- ⁷² StemExpress CEO admits selling beating baby hearts, intact baby heads in Daleiden hearing. [LifeSiteNews webiste]. September 6, 2019, updated Sept. 24, 2019. Available at: https://www.lifesitenews.com/news/stemexpress-ceo-admits-selling-beating-baby-hearts-intact-baby-heads-in-daleiden-hearing. Accessed on September 28, 2019.
- ⁷³ Lan F, Liu J, Narsinh KH, et al. Safe genetic modification of cardiac stem cells using a site-specific integration technique. Circulation. 2012;126(11 Suppl 1):S20-8. PMID: <u>22965984</u>.
- ⁷⁴ StemExpress CEO admits selling beating baby hearts, intact baby heads in Daleiden hearing. [LifeSiteNews webiste]. September 6, 2019, updated Sept. 24, 2019. Available at: https://www.lifesitenews.com/news/stemexpress-ceo-admits-selling-beating-baby-hearts-intact-baby-heads-in-daleiden-hearing. Accessed on September 28, 2019.
- ⁷⁵ Planned Parenthood Endorses Infanticide. [Liberty Counsel website]. September 20, 2019. Available at: https://lc.org/newsroom/details/20190920planned-parenthood-endorses-infanticide. Accessed on September 28, 2019.
- ⁷⁶ Thicke JC, Duncan D, Wood W, Franklin AE, Rhodes AJ. Cultivation of poliomyelitis virus in tissue culture. I. Growth of the Lansing strain in human embryonic tissues. *Canadian Journal of Medical Science*. 1952;30(3):231-45. PMID: 14945014.
- ⁷⁷ Leiva R. A brief history of human diploid cell strains, National Catholic Bioethics Quarterly, 2006;6(3):443-51.
- ⁷⁸ 20/20 Exposes Trafficking In Fetal Body Parts. [The Free Library website]. March 1, 2000. Available at: https://www.thefreelibrary.com/20%2f20+Exposes+Trafficking+In+Fetal+Body+Parts.-a060474305. Accessed on July 20, 2019.
- ⁷⁹ Dear Dr. Nucatola: I used to harvest fetal tissue for Planned Parenthood just like you. [LifeSite website]. July 21, 2015. Available at: https://www.lifesitenews.com/blogs/dear-dr.-nucatola-i-used-to-harvest-fetal-tissue-for-planned-parenthood-too. Accessed on Aug. 1, 2019.
- ⁸⁰ U.S. House of Representatives Final Report, Select Investigative Panel of the Energy and Commerce Committee. Pg. 360. [House.gov website]. December 30, 2016. Available at: https://archives-energycommerce.house.gov/sites/republicans.energycommerce.house.gov/files/documents/Select Investigative Panel Final Report.pdf. Accessed on July 24, 2019.
- 81 Ibid.
- 82 Vaccines Market by Disease (Pneumococcal, Influenza, DTP, HPV, Hepatitis, Meningococcal, Rotavirus, Polio, MMR, Varicella, Dengue), Technology (Live, Toxoid, Recombinant), Route (IM/SC, Oral), Patient (Pediatric, Adult), Type Global Forecast to 2023. [Markets and Markets website]. 2018. Available at: https://www.marketsandmarkets.com/Market-Reports/vaccine-technologies-market-1155.html. Accessed June 12, 2019.
- 83 Fetal body parts used for research. November 2006. Investigate Magazine. [InvestigateDaily website]. Reprinted on March 7, 2012. Available at: https://investigatemagazine.co.nz/2451/fetal-body-parts-used-for-reseach/. Accessed June 14, 2019.

- ⁸⁴ Scientists say fetal tissue remains essential for vaccines and developing treatments. [PBS website]. Aug 11, 2015. Available at: https://www.pbs.org/newshour/health/medical-researchers-say-fetal-tissue-remains-essential. Accessed June 12, 2019.
- ⁸⁵ Medicines in Development for Vaccines 2017 Update. November 9, 2017. [PhRMA website]. Available at: https://www.phrma.org/report/medicines-in-development-vaccines-2017-update. Accessed July 11, 2019.
- ⁸⁶ Table 1. Recommended Child and Adolescent Immunization Schedule for ages 18 years or younger, United States, 2019. [CDC Website]. 2019. Available at: https://www.cdc.gov/vaccines/schedules/hcp/imz/child-adolescent.html. Accessed June 12, 2019.
- ⁸⁷ Table 1. Recommended Adult Immunization Schedule for ages 19 years or older, United States, 2019. [CDC website]. 2019. Available at: https://www.cdc.gov/vaccines/schedules/hcp/imz/adult.html. Accessed June 12, 2019.
- ⁸⁸ U.S. Aborted Fetal Products. [Children of God for Life website]. December 2018. Available at: https://cogforlife.org/wp-content/uploads/fetalproductsall.pdf. Accessed on July 21, 2019.
- ⁸⁹ Aborted fetus cells used in beauty creams. [Washington Times website]. November 3, 2009. Available at: https://m.washingtontimes.com/news/2009/nov/3/aborted-fetus-cells-used-in-anti-aging-products/. Accessed July 21, 2019.
- ⁹⁰ U.S. Aborted Fetal Products. [Children of God for Life website]. December 2018. Available at: https://cogforlife.org/wp-content/uploads/fetalproductsall.pdf. Accessed on July 21, 2019.
- ⁹¹ Senate Bill S240. [The New York State Senate website]. 2019. Available at: https://www.nysenate.gov/legislation/bills/2019/s240. Accessed on October 9, 2019.
- ⁹² HOUSE BILL NO. 2491. [Virginia's Legislative Information System]. 2019. Available at: http://lis.virginia.gov/cgi-bin/legp604.exe?191+ful+HB2491. Accessed October 9, 2019.
- ⁹³ S.311 Born-Alive Abortion Survivors Protection Act. [Congress.gov website]. 2019. Available at: https://www.congress.gov/bill/116th-congress/senate-bill/311/text. Accessed on October, 9,2019.
- ⁹⁴ Alive from New York LIVESTREAM. [Focus on the Family website]. 2019. Available at: https://events.focusonthefamily.com/afny-livestream-2019/. Accessed on October 9, 2019.
- 95 The Sanctity of Human Life. [Focus on the Family website]. 2019. Available at: https://www.focusonthefamily.com/about/foundational-values/. Accessed September 14, 2019.